



John Keel, CPA
State Auditor

A Report on
**The State's Law Enforcement
Salary Schedule (Salary
Schedule C)**

July 2010
Report No. 10-707



John Keel, CPA
State Auditor

A Report on

The State's Law Enforcement Salary Schedule (Salary Schedule C)

SAO Report No. 10-707
July 2010

Overall Conclusion

Salary Schedule C for state agency law enforcement positions is contained within the State's Position Classification Plan, which is part of the General Appropriations Act. Legislative action is required to make changes to it.

The results of this study are presented as an analysis of the current pay for state agency law enforcement officers, as required by Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b). (See Appendix 2 for additional details on the statutory requirement for the State Auditor's Office to review Salary Schedule C.)

This study's primary focus was to compare the State's direct compensation for law enforcement positions with the direct compensation paid by local Texas law enforcement departments that employ more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers. Direct compensation includes base pay and various forms of supplemental pay, such as hazardous duty pay, education pay, and certification pay. The analysis showed that, to make Salary Schedule C more competitive with the market in accordance with Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b), changes would need to be made. Specifically:

- **Comparison with market maximum pay.** Texas Government Code, Section 654.037(b), requires a comparison of Salary Schedule C with market average maximum pay. Aligning Salary Schedule C with the market maximum pay would have a minimum estimated implementation cost to four state agencies of approximately \$27.7 million in each year of the 2012-2013 biennium. The Department of Public Safety would bear 79.2 percent of that cost.
- **Comparison with market mid-range pay.** The State Auditor's Office also compared Salary Schedule C with market average mid-range pay. Aligning Salary Schedule C with the market mid-range pay would have a minimum estimated implementation cost to four state agencies of approximately \$20.0 million in each year of the 2012-2013 biennium. The Department of Public Safety would bear 82.7 percent of that cost.

The fiscal year 2009 turnover rate for Salary Schedule C employees was 5.7 percent, while the overall statewide turnover rate was 14.4 percent. Turnover for

The State's Law Enforcement Salary Schedule (Salary Schedule C)

Salary Schedule C contains salaries for the State's law enforcement positions and is part of the State's Position Classification Plan. This schedule provides the salary structure only for peace officers licensed by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officers Standards and Education who are employed by:

- The Department of Public Safety (80 percent of the State's law enforcement positions).
- The Parks and Wildlife Department (12 percent of the State's law enforcement positions).
- The Alcoholic Beverage Commission (6 percent of the State's law enforcement positions).
- The Department of Criminal Justice (2 percent of the State's law enforcement positions).

This study was conducted in accordance with Texas Government Code, Chapter 654.

For more information regarding this report, please contact Nicole Guerrero, Audit Manager, or John Keel, State Auditor, at (512) 936-9500.

Salary Schedule C employees was 32.5 percent for entry-level positions in salary group C1 (for example, Trooper Trainee; Game Warden Trainee) and 10.6 percent for positions in salary group C8 (for example, Commander, Public Safety; Major, Game Warden). (See Table 5 on page 2 in the Detailed Results section of this report for additional details.)

During the second quarter of fiscal year 2010, Texas state agencies (excluding institutions of higher education) employed 4,477 full-time classified law enforcement officers who were paid in accordance with Salary Schedule C; this represented 2.9 percent of the total state agency workforce.¹ In fiscal year 2009:

- The State spent approximately \$262.3 million on base pay, hazardous duty pay, and overtime pay for these positions. (See Table 3 on page 1 in the Detailed Results section of this report for additional details.)
- The State spent approximately \$6.3 million on supplemental pay in the form of certification pay, education pay, and bilingual capability pay. (See Table 4 on page 2 in the Detailed Results section of this report for additional details.)

Key Points

Salary rates for certain salary groups within Salary Schedule C are not competitive with the market.

Maximum salary rates for state journey-level law enforcement positions (for example, Troopers and Game Wardens in salary group C3) would need to increase by 16.0 percent to match the average maximum pay of the local Texas law enforcement departments included in this study's analysis.²

Maximum salary rates for state senior-level law enforcement positions (for example, Sergeants, Lieutenants, and Captains in salary groups C4 through C6) would need to increase by 14.1 percent to 19.8 percent to match the average maximum pay of the local Texas law enforcement departments included in this study's analysis.

¹ Law enforcement positions at higher education institutions were not included in this review because higher education institutions do not pay employees in accordance with the State's Position Classification Plan.

² Advanced Police Officer/Corporal maximum pay from these departments was included in the overall analysis for the Trooper position within salary group C3.

Aligning Salary Schedule C with the market maximum pay of the 7 local law enforcement agencies in Texas with 1,000 or more commissioned officers would have a minimum estimated cost to four agencies of approximately \$27.7 million in each year of the 2012-2013 biennium.

Fifty-three percent of the costs of aligning Salary Schedule C with market maximum pay are associated with positions in salary group C3, which includes Trooper and Game Warden positions. The majority of these positions are at the Department of Public Safety.

Table 1 summarizes the minimum estimated costs of aligning Salary Schedule C with market maximum pay. These costs do not include any of the benefit-related costs (for example, additional retirement, Medicare, and Social Security costs) that agencies would incur.

Table 1

Summary of Minimum Annual Costs Associated with Aligning Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Maximum</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium			
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Annual Costs	Number of Employees Whose Salaries Would Be Affected by the Change
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$ 560,015	155
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	973,395	236
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	14,740,394	2,663
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden	6,211,224	964
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden	2,241,340	224
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden	2,008,284	130
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden	140,888	8
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden	867,240	40
Totals		\$ 27,742,780	4,420^a

^a Number excludes employee separations that occurred during the second quarter of fiscal year 2010.

Aligning Salary Schedule C with the market mid-range pay of the 7 local law agencies in Texas with 1,000 or more commissioned officers would have a minimum estimated cost to four agencies of approximately \$20.0 million each year of the 2012-2013 biennium.

Thirty-nine percent of the costs are associated with positions in salary group C4, which includes Sergeant positions. The majority of these positions are at the Department of Public Safety.

Table 2 summarizes the minimum estimated costs associated with aligning Salary Schedule C with market mid-range pay. These costs do not include any of the benefit-related costs (for example, additional retirement, Medicare, and Social Security costs) that agencies would incur.

Table 2

Summary of Minimum Annual Costs Associated with Aligning Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Mid-range</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium			
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Annual Costs	Number of Employees Whose Salaries Would Be Affected by the Change
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$ 467,015	155
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	713,795	236
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	6,773,994	2,663
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden	7,757,624	964
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden	2,307,140	224
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden	1,470,284	130
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden	80,488	8
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden	384,240	40
Totals		\$ 19,954,580	4,420^a

^a Number excludes employee separations that occurred during the second quarter of fiscal year 2010.

The State also provides various types of supplemental pay to employees who are paid according to Salary Schedule C.

The State's supplemental pay (for example, education pay, certification pay, and bilingual pay) is below the average supplemental pay provided by local Texas law enforcement departments that employ more than 1,000 commissioned officers. The State's hazardous duty pay (known as longevity pay at the local Texas law enforcement departments reviewed) is competitive with the market.

Summary of Objective, Scope, and Methodology

The objective of this review was to conduct a review of the market competitiveness of the State's law enforcement salary schedule (Salary Schedule C).

The scope of this study included a review of the State's law enforcement total direct compensation in relation to average maximum and average mid-range pay of the local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. The State Auditor's Office conducted this review in accordance with the Position Classification Act in Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b) (see Appendix 2 for additional details).

The State Auditor's Office conducts periodic studies of salary rates and trends in other governmental agencies for work similar to that performed by the State's law enforcement positions classified within the law enforcement salary schedule. To determine current salary rates and trends, the State Auditor's Office conducted a survey of local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers. The salary survey was conducted from April 2010 through June 2010. As part of this review, job descriptions were gathered from seven local Texas law enforcement departments to ensure that appropriate matches were made to similar jobs within the State.

In reviewing salary rates for law enforcement positions, the State Auditor's Office used the following positions as the benchmark jobs for their respective salary groups:

- Trooper - Department of Public Safety (salary group C3).
- Sergeant - Department of Public Safety (salary group C4).
- Lieutenant - Department of Public Safety (salary group C5).
- Captain - Department of Public Safety (salary group C6).

This project was a review; therefore, the information in this report was not subjected to all the tests and confirmations that would be performed in an audit. However, the information in this report was subject to certain quality control procedures to ensure accuracy.

Contents

Detailed Results

Chapter 1	
Background Information on the State’s Law Enforcement Positions	1
Chapter 2	
Analysis of Law Enforcement Total Direct Compensation Package	8
Chapter 3	
Aligning with Market Maximum Pay Would Cost Approximately \$27.7 Million Annually; Aligning with Market Mid-Range Pay Would Cost Approximately \$20.0 Million Annually	16
Chapter 4	
In Addition to Base Pay, the State Provides Supplemental Pay to Individuals in Law Enforcement Positions	20

Appendices

Appendix 1	
Objective, Scope, and Methodology	23
Appendix 2	
Excerpts from the Texas Government Code	26
Appendix 3	
Retirement Benefits Provided by the Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments Reviewed	27
Appendix 4	
Law Enforcement Pay at Selected Higher Education Institutions	29

Appendix 5
Summary of Supplemental Pay Provided by Local Texas
Law Enforcement Departments with More than 1,000
Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers 31

Appendix 6
Five Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments That
Provide the Highest Average Total Direct Compensation 32

Appendix 7
Law Enforcement Salary Survey Results 33

Detailed Results

Chapter 1

Background Information on the State's Law Enforcement Positions

During the second quarter of fiscal year 2010, Texas state agencies (excluding higher education institutions) employed 4,477 full-time classified law enforcement officers who were paid in accordance with the law enforcement salary schedule (Salary Schedule C) within the State's Position Classification Plan. These 4,477 positions represented 2.9 percent of the total state agency workforce.³

Eighty percent of the State's law enforcement employees work for the Department of Public Safety. The remainder work for the Parks and Wildlife Department (12 percent), the Alcoholic Beverage Commission (6 percent), and the Department of Criminal Justice (2 percent).

Fiscal Year 2009 Compensation Expenditures for Law Enforcement Positions

In fiscal year 2009, base pay, hazardous duty pay, overtime pay, and supplemental pay for state agency law enforcement positions totaled \$268.6 million. Specifically:

- The State spent approximately \$262.3 million in base pay, hazardous duty pay, and overtime pay (see Table 3).
- The State spent approximately \$6.3 million on supplemental pay for certification, education, and bilingual capabilities (see Table 4 on the next page).

Table 3

Summary of Compensation Expenditures by State Law Enforcement Agencies Fiscal Year 2009				
Agency	Base Pay	Hazardous Duty Pay	Overtime Pay	Totals ^a
Alcoholic Beverage Commission	\$ 13,927,270	\$ 312,900	\$ 490,283	\$ 14,730,453
Department of Criminal Justice	2,661,640	69,934	319,086	3,050,660
Parks and Wildlife Department	27,204,281	687,820	401,551	28,293,651
Department of Public Safety	193,200,805	5,113,430	17,861,634	216,175,868
Totals^a	\$236,993,996	\$6,184,084	\$19,072,553	\$262,250,633

^a Totals may not sum precisely due to rounding.

Sources: Uniform Statewide Personnel/Payroll System and Standardized Payroll/Personnel Reporting System. Information in this table excludes expenditures for education pay, certification pay, and bilingual pay.

³ Law enforcement positions at higher education institutions were not included in this review because higher education institutions are not subject to the State's Position Classification Plan.

Table 4

Summary of Supplemental Pay Provided by State Law Enforcement Agencies Fiscal Year 2009	
Agency	Supplemental Pay
Alcoholic Beverage Commission	\$ 423,293
Department of Criminal Justice	144,617
Parks and Wildlife Department	731,046
Department of Public Safety	5,012,919
Total	\$6,311,875

Sources: Uniform Statewide Personnel/Payroll System and Standardized Payroll/Personnel Reporting System.

Turnover Among Law Enforcement Positions

Statewide turnover for classified regular full-time employees paid according to Salary Schedule C was 5.7 percent in fiscal year 2009. The turnover rate for the law enforcement salary schedule was lower than the overall statewide turnover rate for fiscal year 2009, which was 14.4 percent.

Table 5 provides information regarding the number of full-time classified employees paid according to the law enforcement salary schedule during the second quarter of fiscal year 2010 and turnover information for fiscal year 2009.

Table 5

Law Enforcement Salary Schedule (Salary Schedule C) Number of Employees for the Second Quarter of Fiscal Year 2010 and Fiscal Year 2009 Turnover Rates				
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Fiscal Year 2010 Second Quarter		Fiscal Year 2009 Turnover Rate ^a
		Number of Full-time Classified Employees	Percentage of Salary Schedule C Employees	
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	161	3.6%	32.5%
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	242	5.4%	4.9%
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	2,692	60.2%	4.8%
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden	972	21.7%	3.4%
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden	228	5.1%	3.9%
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden	132	2.9%	8.1%

**Law Enforcement Salary Schedule (Salary Schedule C)
Number of Employees for the Second Quarter of Fiscal Year 2010
and Fiscal Year 2009 Turnover Rates**

Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Fiscal Year 2010 Second Quarter		Fiscal Year 2009 Turnover Rate ^a
		Number of Full-time Classified Employees	Percentage of Salary Schedule C Employees	
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden	8	0.2%	10.0%
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden	42	0.9%	10.6%
Totals		4,477	100.0%	5.7%

^a The fiscal year 2009 turnover rate excludes interagency transfers and is only for classified regular full-time employees.

Sources: Uniform Statewide Payroll System, Human Resources Information System, and Statewide Payroll/Personnel Reporting System.

Although the turnover rates for employees within salary group C1 (Trooper Trainee, Game Warden Trainee, and Investigator Trainee – Office of the Inspector General) appear high when compared with other salary groups, these rates could be influenced by situations such as the vigorous demands of the Trooper and Game Warden training and probationary programs.

Indirect Compensation for Law Enforcement Positions

The State Auditor’s Office did not review indirect compensation (for example, health care benefits, Social Security and Medicare, and retirement); however, a summary of retirement benefits provided by the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis is presented in Appendix 3. Information on non-financial rewards (for example, employee recognition programs, professional training and career development, and a challenging and rewarding work environment) also was not reviewed. The State Auditor’s Office previously reported on these types of benefits and rewards in *A Report on State Employee Benefits as a Percentage of Total Compensation* (State Auditor’s Office Report No. 10-704, February 2010).

Base Pay for Law Enforcement Positions

The job classifications within Salary Schedule C provide rates of pay based on rank and number of years of service. Typically, an employee starts at the lowest rank within an agency. Law enforcement employees compensated according to Salary Schedule C currently are not eligible to receive merit increases or one-time merit payments.

Salary Schedule C was increased for the 2010-2011 biennium. Table 6 shows this salary schedule.

Table 6

Salary Schedule C 2010-2011 Biennium							
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	< 4 Years of Service	≥ 4 Years of Service	≥ 8 Years of Service	≥ 12 Years of Service	≥ 16 Years of Service	≥ 20 Years of Service
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$35,787					
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	\$39,097					
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	\$47,221	\$50,988	\$54,860	\$58,504	\$60,307	\$61,793
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden		\$57,578	\$61,677	\$64,402	\$67,377	\$69,043
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden		\$64,489	\$68,859	\$71,682	\$74,848	\$76,714
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden		\$71,470	\$76,077	\$79,001	\$82,359	\$84,427
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden		\$87,719	\$88,529	\$88,939	\$88,939	\$88,939
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden		\$91,200	\$91,935	\$92,394	\$92,394	\$92,394

Source: General Appropriations Act, 81st Legislature, Article IX, Section 2.01, Schedule C Classification Salary Schedule.

Depending on an employee's rank and placement within Salary Schedule C, salary increases associated with the revised Salary Schedule C for the 2010-2011 biennium ranged from 2.35 percent for employees in salary group C1 (for example, trainees) to 9.09 percent for a law enforcement officer with 20 or more years of service in salary group C6 (for example, Captain). Table 7 provides information on the percentage changes in salary that the majority of employees received for the 2010-2011 biennium.

Table 7

Salary Schedule C Salary Increases for the 2010-2011 Biennium							
Salary Group	Job Classifications	< 4 Years of Service	≥ 4 Years of Service	≥ 8 Years of Service	≥ 12 Years of Service	≥ 16 Years of Service	≥ 20 Years of Service
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	2.35%					
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	2.35%					
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	4.70%	4.25%	4.17%	4.34%	4.46%	7.03%
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden		3.53%	3.88%	4.44%	4.81%	7.40%
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden		3.53%	4.20%	5.08%	5.66%	8.30%
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden		3.53%	4.52%	5.66%	6.42%	9.09%
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden		7.56%	8.28%	8.78%	8.78%	8.78%
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden		6.01%	6.75%	7.28%	7.28%	7.28%

Employees who were paid according to Salary Schedule C were not eligible to receive the \$800 one-time retention bonus paid to other eligible state employees on August 31, 2009, because they received a designated raise on September 1, 2009.

Although higher education institutions were not included in the scope of this review, the State Auditor's Office collected information on law enforcement salaries from the higher education institutions located in the same vicinity as the local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. A summary of the salary rates from a sample of these higher education institutions is included in Appendix 4.

Supplemental Pay for Law Enforcement Positions

During fiscal year 2009, the State spent approximately \$6.2 million in hazardous duty pay and approximately \$6.3 million in stipend pay for its law enforcement positions.

Hazardous Duty Pay. State law enforcement employees receive hazardous duty pay if they have completed at least 12 months of lifetime service credit by the last day of the preceding month. The amount of an employee's hazardous duty pay is based on the number of months served in a hazardous duty position, which is also known as "lifetime service credit." Currently, eligible employees receive \$10 per month for each 12-month period of lifetime service credit, and there is no cap on the maximum hazardous duty pay an employee can receive. For example, an employee in a position authorized to receive hazardous duty pay who has 31 years of state hazardous duty service earns an additional \$3,720 annually.

Salary Stipends. Provisions of the General Appropriations Act authorize the Department of Public Safety, the Department of Criminal Justice, the Parks and Wildlife Department, and the Alcoholic Beverage Commission to pay commissioned peace officers salary stipends at rates that exceed the maximum rates in Salary Schedule C. These salary stipends are paid to law enforcement officers who achieve certain levels of skill or certifications as approved by the agencies. Examples of these skills and certifications include:

- Education: \$50 per month for an associate's degree, \$100 per month for a bachelor's degree, and \$150 per month for a master's degree. With a master's degree, an employee is eligible to receive \$1,800 per year.
- Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education (TCLEOSE) certification: \$50 per month for intermediate, \$100 per month for advanced, and \$150 per month for masters. At the highest TCLEOSE certification level, an employee is eligible to receive \$1,800 per year.
- Bilingual capabilities: \$50 per month for the ability to speak a language other than English. On a yearly basis, this provides an additional \$600 to an employee's pay.
- Commissioned peace officers may receive a stipend for education or certification, but not both.

Additional Stipends. Employees holding the rank of Corporal with the Department of Public Safety receive an additional \$50 per month. Employees assigned to this rank receive a total of \$600 each fiscal year. According to the Department of Public Safety, this stipend is provided to Corporals who have been assigned additional administrative duties. If there is a change in duty assignments and rank, the stipend does not transfer with the employee. Therefore, this stipend is similar to assignment pay.

Total Direct Compensation

Table 8 provides an overview of maximum total direct compensation provided to an employee assigned to salary group C3 (for example, Trooper) in Salary Schedule C who has 30 years of state service.

Table 8

Example of Maximum Total Direct Compensation For a Trooper (C3) with 30 Years of State Service	
Base salary (salary group C3 at 20 or more years of service)	\$61,793
Hazardous duty pay (30 years of service)	3,600
Certification pay (master's level) or education pay (master's level) ^a	1,800
Bilingual pay (ability to speak a language other than English)	600
Total Direct Compensation	\$67,793
^a Law enforcement employees are eligible to receive certification pay or education pay, but not both.	

Analysis of Law Enforcement Total Direct Compensation Package

Statutory Requirement for Law Enforcement Salary Rate Review

Texas Government Code, Chapter 654, gives the State Auditor’s Office statutory responsibility for (1) maintaining and keeping the State’s Position Classification Plan current and (2) making recommendations that are necessary and desirable about the operation of the State’s Position Classification Plan and for improvement of the State’s Position Classification Plan to the Governor and the Legislature.

Texas Government Code, Section 654.037(b), provides specific instructions for reviewing the salary rates of law enforcement positions (see text box for additional details). Because Salary Schedule C is contained within the State’s Position Classification Plan (which is part of the General Appropriations Act), legislative action is required to make changes to it.

As required by statute, the State Auditor’s Office analyzed the direct compensation packages provided by seven local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers. Direct compensation includes base pay and various forms of supplemental pay. For the purposes of this analysis, supplemental pay includes hazardous duty or longevity pay and other salary-related stipends (for example, education pay, certification pay, and bilingual pay). Table 9 provides information on the local Texas law enforcement departments the State Auditor’s Office surveyed in spring 2010.

Excerpt from Texas Government Code, Section 654.037(b)

The classification officer shall conduct, before September 1 of each even-numbered year, a survey of local law enforcement departments that employ more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers to gather information about the total compensation provided by the departments to law enforcement officers.

Before January 1 of each odd-numbered year, the classification officer shall analyze the findings of the most recent survey conducted in accordance with this subsection and shall submit to the legislature a report on the findings of the survey and analysis. The report must identify the five local law enforcement departments that provide the highest average total compensation to local law enforcement officers who have been employed by the local law enforcement departments at the maximum salary level.

Table 9

Texas Local Law Enforcement Departments That Have 1,000 or More Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers	
Law Enforcement Department	Number of Officers ^a
State of Texas	4,477
City of Austin	1,624
City of Dallas	3,661
City of El Paso	1,097
City of Fort Worth	1,531
City of Houston	5,311
City of San Antonio	2,275
Harris County	2,359

^a Number of officers is dependent on how the law enforcement department reported its data, which could be either budgeted positions or actual number of employees in positions.

Sources: State Auditor’s Office law enforcement survey and Electronic Classification Analysis System.

In reviewing salary rates for law enforcement positions, the State Auditor’s Office used the following positions as the benchmark jobs for their respective salary groups:

- Trooper – Department of Public Safety (salary group C3).
- Sergeant – Department of Public Safety (salary group C4).
- Lieutenant – Department of Public Safety (salary group C5).
- Captain – Department of Public Safety (salary group C6).

A benchmark job refers to a job or a group of jobs that is used for making pay comparisons, either within or outside an organization. The State Auditor’s Office used these benchmarks to determine where positions fell in relation to the market.

Chapter 2-A

Analysis Based on Maximum Pay

Salary rates for state journey-level law enforcement positions (for example, Troopers and Game Wardens) would need to be changed to achieve market competitiveness using the methodology in Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b), which requires a comparison with maximum pay in the market.

Journey-level Positions

The analysis indicated that the State’s maximum pay for journey-level law enforcement positions in salary group C3 (for example, Troopers) would need to increase by 16.0 percent to match the average maximum pay of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. Table 10 provides information regarding this analysis.

Table 10

Salary Schedule C Market Analysis Based on Maximum Pay for Trooper (C3) Positions			
Salary Group (Rank)	State’s Maximum Salary	Average Maximum Salary of Seven Local Law Enforcement Departments in Analysis	Percent Increase Needed for the State’s Maximum Salary to Match Market Average Maximum Salary
Trooper (C3)	\$61,793	\$71,689	16.0%

Sources: The State’s Salary Schedule C and analysis of information from State Auditor’s Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

Table 11 provides the ranking based on maximum pay for Police Officers, Senior Police Officers, Investigator/Detectives, and Corporals (salary group C3) in the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis.

Table 11

Salary Ranking Based on Maximum Pay (Based on Maximum Pay for Police Officer, Senior Police Officer, and Corporal Positions)			
Local Texas Law Enforcement Department	Ranking Based on Maximum Base Pay Available	Maximum of Salary Range	Local Texas Law Enforcement Department Maximum as a Percent of State Maximum Salary
City of Austin	1	\$ 89,983	146%
City of Fort Worth	2	\$ 79,851	129%
City of Dallas	3	\$ 74,837	121%
Harris County	4	\$ 70,366	114%
City of San Antonio	5	\$ 66,828	108%
City of El Paso	6	\$ 60,763	98%
City of Houston	7	\$ 59,192	96%
Average		\$ 71,689	116%
State of Texas		\$ 61,793	

Source: State Auditor's Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

The State Auditor's Office also reviewed maximum pay provided for other law enforcement positions by Texas cities with populations of 50,000 or more that participated in the Texas Municipal League Salary Survey. These cities' average maximum pay for a position similar to that of positions in salary group C3 (for example, a Trooper) was \$61,094. This is 1.1 percent lower than the maximum pay for state law enforcement positions assigned to salary group C3 (\$61,793 maximum pay).

Senior-level and Supervisory Positions

Salary rates for state senior-level and supervisory law enforcement positions also would need to be changed to achieve market competitiveness using the methodology based on market maximum pay specified in Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b). Salary rates for senior-level and supervisory law enforcement positions in salary groups C4 through C6 (for example, Sergeants, Lieutenants, and Captains) would need to increase by 14.1 percent to 19.8 percent to match the average maximum pay of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. Table 12 provides additional details that show the competitiveness of salaries for the State's law enforcement senior-level and supervisory positions.

Table 12

Market Analysis for Senior-level and Supervisory Positions Based on Maximum Pay For Law Enforcement Benchmark Jobs			
Current Salary Group (Benchmark Job)	Salary Range Maximum	Average Maximum Salary of Seven Local Law Enforcement Departments in Analysis	Percent Increase Needed for the State's Maximum Salary to Match Market Average Maximum Salary
Sergeant - Department of Public Safety (C4)	\$69,043	\$ 78,778	14.1%
Lieutenant - Department of Public Safety (C5)	\$76,714	\$ 88,714	15.6%
Captain - Department of Public Safety (C6)	\$84,427	\$101,125	19.8%

Sources: The State's Salary Schedule C and analysis of information from State Auditor's Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

The review of the senior-level and supervisory maximum pay for cities with populations of 50,000 or more indicated that the maximum average for a Sergeant position was \$71,064. For the Lieutenant position, the average maximum pay was \$78,489, and for the Captain position, the maximum average pay was \$94,873. (Salary data for the seven local Texas law enforcement departments with 1,000 or more commissioned officers was excluded in determining these maximum averages.) Table 13 provides the percentage increases needed to match the average maximum pay for these cities.

Table 13

Market Analysis for Senior-Level and Supervisory-Level Law Enforcement Benchmark Jobs Based on Maximum Pay at Texas Cities with Populations of 50,000 or More			
Current Salary Group (Benchmark Job)	Salary Range Maximum	Market Average Maximum Pay	Percent Increase Needed for the State's Maximum Salary to Match Market Average Maximum Salary
Sergeant - Department of Public Safety (C4)	\$69,043	\$71,064	2.9%
Lieutenant - Department of Public Safety (C5)	\$76,714	\$78,489	2.3%
Captain - Department of Public Safety (C6)	\$84,427	\$94,873	12.4%

Sources: The State's Salary Schedule C and analysis of information from Texas Municipal League Salary Survey.

The Legislature may wish to consider revising Salary Schedule C to provide competitive salaries to journey-level, senior-level, and supervisory law enforcement positions. Table 14 on the next page presents a salary schedule for law enforcement positions that would provide for competitive salaries.

The schedule, which was developed using the methodology in Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b), would bring the positions to the market average maximum pay when compared to the seven law enforcement departments in this analysis.

Table 14

Salary Schedule C Based on Comparison of <u>Maximum</u> Pay with Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments For the 2012-2013 Biennium ^a							
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	< 4 Years of Service	≥ 4 Years of Service	≥ 8 Years of Service	≥ 12 Years of Service	≥ 16 Years of Service	≥ 20 Years of Service
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$39,400					
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	\$43,400					
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	\$51,400	\$55,400	\$ 59,400	\$63,400	\$67,400	\$71,400
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden		\$62,400	\$ 66,400	\$70,400	\$74,400	\$ 78,400
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden		\$72,300	\$ 76,300	\$80,300	\$84,300	\$ 88,300
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden		\$84,800	\$ 88,800	\$92,800	\$96,800	\$100,800
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden		\$104,800	\$105,800	\$106,800	\$107,800	\$107,800
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden		\$111,800	\$112,800	\$113,800	\$114,800	\$114,800

^a This schedule was developed using the salary analysis methodology in Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b). It is based on the average maximum pay of the 7 local Texas law enforcement agencies with 1,000 or more commissioned officers.

Analysis Based on Mid-range Pay

In addition to the methodology prescribed by Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b), the State Auditor’s Office compared Salary Schedule C with the average mid-range pay of the 7 local Texas law enforcement agencies with 1,000 or more commissioned law enforcement officers.

Journey-level Positions

The analysis indicated that the State’s mid-range pay for journey-level law enforcement positions in salary group C3 (for example, Troopers) would need to increase by 6.2 percent to match the average mid-range pay of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. Table 15 provides information regarding this analysis.

Table 15

Salary Schedule C Market Analysis Based on Mid-range Pay for Trooper (C3) Positions			
Salary Group (Rank)	State’s Mid-range Salary	Average Mid-range Salary of Seven Local Law Enforcement Departments in Analysis	Percent Increase Needed for the State’s Mid-range Salary to Match Market Average Mid-range Salary
Trooper (C3)	\$54,507	\$57,895	6.2%

Sources: The State’s Salary Schedule C and analysis of information from State Auditor’s Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

Senior-level and Supervisory Positions

Salary rates for state senior-level and supervisory law enforcement positions also would need to be changed to achieve market competitiveness if using a mid-range methodology. Specifically, salary rates for senior-level and supervisory law enforcement positions currently in salary groups C4 through C6 (for example, Sergeants, Lieutenants, and Captains) would need to increase by 13.8 percent to 19.9 percent to match the average mid-range pay of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis.

Table 16 provides additional details that show the competitiveness of the State's law enforcement senior-level and supervisory positions.

Table 16

Market Analysis for Senior-level and Supervisory Positions Based on Mid-Range Pay For Law Enforcement Benchmark Jobs			
Current Salary Group (Benchmark Job)	Mid-range Salary	Average Mid-range Salary of Seven Local Law Enforcement Departments in Analysis	Percent Increase Needed for the State's Mid-range Salary to Match Market Average Mid-range Salary
Sergeant - Department of Public Safety (C4)	\$63,310.50	\$72,060	13.8%
Lieutenant - Department of Public Safety (C5)	\$70,601.50	\$81,571	15.5%
Captain - Department of Public Safety (C6)	\$77,948.50	\$93,485	19.9%

Sources: The State's Salary Schedule C and analysis of information from State Auditor's Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

An alternative salary schedule based on the mid-range market comparisons is presented in Table 17. This would bring the positions to the market average mid-range pay when compared to the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis.

Table 17

Salary Schedule C Based on Comparison of <u>Mid-Range Pay</u> with Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments For the 2012-2013 Biennium ^a							
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	< 4 Years of Service	≥ 4 Years of Service	≥ 8 Years of Service	≥ 12 Years of Service	≥ 16 Years of Service	≥ 20 Years of Service
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$38,800					
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	\$42,300					
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	\$50,300	\$ 53,300	\$ 56,300	\$ 59,300	\$ 62,300	\$ 65,300
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden		\$ 66,000	\$ 69,000	\$ 72,000	\$ 75,000	\$ 78,000
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden		\$ 75,500	\$ 78,500	\$ 81,500	\$ 84,500	\$ 87,500

Salary Schedule C
Based on Comparison of Mid-Range Pay with Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments
For the 2012-2013 Biennium^a

Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	< 4 Years of Service	≥ 4 Years of Service	≥ 8 Years of Service	≥ 12 Years of Service	≥ 16 Years of Service	≥ 20 Years of Service
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden		\$ 84,000	\$ 87,000	\$ 90,000	\$ 93,000	\$ 96,000
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden		\$ 99,000	\$ 99,000	\$ 99,000	\$ 99,000	\$ 99,000
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden		\$102,000	\$102,000	\$102,000	\$102,000	\$102,000

^a This schedule was developed using a mid-range salary analysis methodology. It is based on the average mid-range pay of the seven local Texas law enforcement agencies with 1,000 or more commissioned officers.

Aligning with Market Maximum Pay Would Cost Approximately \$27.7 Million Annually; Aligning with Market Mid-Range Pay Would Cost Approximately \$20.0 Million Annually

Comparison with Market Maximum Pay

The minimum estimated cost to align Salary Schedule C with average market maximum pay would be \$27.7 million annually for the 2012-2013 biennium. To determine the minimum estimated cost, the State Auditor's Office calculated the fiscal impact of moving the employees to the proposed new rates of pay for the classifications in the various salary groups. These changes would affect 4,420 classified regular full-time employees. Table 18 provides the estimated cost for each of the salary groups.

Table 18

Annual Cost to Align Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Maximum</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium			
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Annual Cost Associated with Change	Percentage of Implementation Cost
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$ 560,015	2.0%
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	973,395	3.5%
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	14,740,394	53.2%
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden	6,211,224	22.4%
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden	2,241,340	8.1%
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden	2,008,284	7.2%
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden	140,888	0.5%
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden	867,240	3.1%
Total Annual Cost		\$ 27,742,780	100.0%

Table 19 provides a list of the associated costs by agency.

Table 19

Annual Cost by Agency to Align Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Maximum</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium		
Agency	Cost Associated with Salary Schedule Modifications	Percentage of Implementation Cost
Department of Public Safety	\$21,990,117	79.2%
Parks and Wildlife Department	3,635,649	13.1%
Alcoholic Beverage Commission	1,514,098	5.5%
Department of Criminal Justice	602,916	2.2%
Total Annual Cost	\$27,742,780	100.0%

The minimum estimated annual cost includes only the cost associated with moving job classifications to the new rate of pay within the salary groups. The minimum estimated annual cost does not include any of the additional benefit-related costs (for example, additional retirement and mandated income protection programs) that agencies incur during the Position Classification Plan conversion process.

Comparison with Market Mid-Range Pay

The minimum estimated cost to align Salary Schedule C with average market mid-range pay would be approximately \$20.0 million annually for the 2012-2013 biennium. To determine the minimum estimated cost, the State Auditor's Office calculated the fiscal impact of moving the employees to the proposed new rates of pay based on the mid-range analysis for the classifications in the various salary groups.

Using these calculations, the State Auditor's Office calculated the fiscal impact of moving the employees to the appropriate salary group and pay step within Salary Schedule C. Under this methodology, approximately 39 percent of the costs are associated with positions in salary group C4, which includes Sergeant positions. The majority of these positions are at the Department of Public Safety.

The changes would affect 4,420 classified regular full-time employees. Table 20 provides the estimated annual cost for each of the salary groups.

Table 20

Annual Cost to Align Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Mid-Range</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium			
Salary Group	Job Classification Titles	Annual Cost Associated with Change	Percentage of Implementation Cost
C1	Trooper Trainee; Investigator Trainee - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden Trainee	\$ 467,015	2.3%
C2	Probationary Trooper; Agent Trainee; Probationary Game Warden	713,795	3.6%
C3	Trooper; Corporal; Agent; Investigator - Office of the Inspector General; Game Warden	6,773,994	33.9%
C4	Sergeant, Public Safety; Sergeant, Alcoholic Beverage; Pilot Investigator I; Regional Supervisor - Office of the Inspector General; Sergeant, Game Warden	7,757,624	38.9%
C5	Lieutenant, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector I; Pilot Investigator II; Lieutenant, Alcoholic Beverage; Regional Manager - Office of the Inspector General; Lieutenant, Game Warden	2,307,140	11.6%
C6	Captain, Public Safety; Public Safety Inspector II; Pilot Investigator III; Captain, Alcoholic Beverage; Multi-Regional Administrator - Office of the Inspector General; Captain, Game Warden	1,470,284	7.4%
C7	Assistant Commander, Public Safety; Pilot Investigator IV; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (12 years or less); Assistant Commander, Game Warden	80,488	0.4%
C8	Commander, Public Safety; Major, Public Safety; Major, Alcoholic Beverage; Chief Inspector - Office of the Inspector General (More than 12 years); Commander, Game Warden; Major, Game Warden	384,240	1.9%
Total Annual Cost		\$19,954,580	100.0%

Table 21 provides a list of the associated costs by agency.

Table 21

Annual Cost by Agency to Align Salary Schedule C with Market <u>Mid-range</u> Pay For the 2012-2013 Biennium		
Agency	Cost Associated with Salary Schedule Modifications	Percentage of Implementation Cost
Department of Public Safety	\$16,512,217	82.7%
Parks and Wildlife Department	2,045,349	10.3%
Alcoholic Beverage Commission	1,005,598	5.0%
Department of Criminal Justice	391,416	2.0%
Total Annual Cost	\$19,954,580	100.0%

The minimum estimated annual cost includes only the cost associated with moving job classifications to the new rate of pay within the salary groups. The minimum estimated annual cost does not include any of the additional benefit-related costs (for example, additional retirement and mandated income protection programs) that agencies incur during the Position Classification Plan conversion process.

In Addition to Base Pay, the State Provides Supplemental Pay to Individuals in Law Enforcement Positions

In fiscal year 2009, the State paid approximately \$6.2 million to law enforcement officers for hazardous duty pay as authorized by state statute. In addition, the State spent approximately \$6.3 million for stipend pay, such as education pay, certification, and bilingual pay as authorized by the General Appropriations Act. Table 22 provides information regarding hazardous duty pay and the various types of stipend pay (for example, education pay, certification pay, bilingual pay) provided by the seven local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers reviewed in this analysis. The table also shows the difference between the State's maximum supplemental pay and the supplemental pay provided by the seven local Texas law enforcement departments. Appendix 5 provides additional details regarding the supplemental pay provided by these departments.

Table 22

Average Supplemental Pay for Seven Law Enforcement Departments Compared with Supplemental Pay for the State of Texas			
Supplemental Pay Type	Average Annual Amount	State of Texas	Percent Increase Needed for the State's Supplemental Pay to Match Market Average
Education pay - bachelor's degree	\$ 2,483	\$1,200	106.9%
Certification pay - master's certification ^a	4,606	1,800	155.9%
Longevity pay ^b	3,018	3,600	No adjustment needed
Bilingual pay	1,500	600	150.0%
Field training officer (FTO) duty pay ^c	1,869	Not Available to Officers	
Shift differential pay ^c	3,481	Not Available to Officers	
Potential Total Supplemental Pay^d	\$16,957	\$6,000	182.6%
<p>^a Three of the seven departments provide either education pay or certification pay, but not both. These three agencies were excluded from the average for certification pay.</p> <p>^b In Texas, for law enforcement agencies that use Salary Schedule C, hazardous duty pay is paid in lieu of longevity pay. The calculation shown above is based on 30 years of service. There is no cap on the amount of hazardous duty pay a law enforcement officer may receive.</p> <p>^c FTO duty pay and shift differential pay calculations are based on the average salary for the respective organization.</p> <p>^d The potential total supplemental pay for the State of Texas considers only the highest yearly supplemental pay (either education pay or certification pay). The State provides either education pay or certification pay, but not both.</p>			

Education Pay and Certification Pay

All seven local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers provide education pay. This education pay can be earned by completing college-level courses that are beyond the minimum requirements for the position. Typically, law enforcement departments provide this pay in various amounts for an associate's degree, a bachelor's degree, or a master's degree. The average education pay for a bachelor's degree at the seven law enforcement departments in this analysis was \$2,483. In comparison, state law enforcement employees are authorized to receive a maximum of \$1,200 in education pay for a bachelor's degree.

Certification pay or a similar type of pay is available at all seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis. To qualify for certification pay, a State of Texas law enforcement officer must meet the proficiency requirements in Title 37, Texas Administrative Code, Section 221.3. Certification pay can be earned by completing a combination of training hours or degrees and having certain experience as a peace officer. Typically, law enforcement departments provide this pay at various amounts for intermediate certification, advance certification, and master certification or levels determined by the department. The City of Austin, the City of Fort Worth, and Harris County provided either education pay or certification pay. The average certification pay for a master's certification at the other four law enforcement departments in this analysis was \$4,606. State law enforcement positions are authorized to receive a maximum of \$1,800 in certification pay for a master's certification. However, like the cities of Austin and Fort Worth and Harris County, state law enforcement positions can receive education pay or certification pay, but not both.

Longevity and Hazardous Duty Pay

All seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis provide longevity pay. The maximum amounts range from \$1,200 per year (City of Dallas) to \$12,029 (City of San Antonio⁴). The average longevity pay provided by the seven departments was \$3,018 per year.

The State provides a similar type of pay to its authorized law enforcement officers called hazardous duty pay. Currently, this pay is authorized at \$10 per month for each 12-month period of lifetime service credit. The 80th Legislature passed legislation removing the cap on the maximum hazardous duty pay. For example, an employee in a position authorized to receive hazardous duty pay who has 31 years of state hazardous duty service earns an additional \$3,720 annually.

⁴ The City of San Antonio's longevity calculation provides that each officer's base pay will be increased by 3 percent for each 5 years of service (5 years of longevity), to a maximum of 30 years. For example, a 30-year veteran would receive an additional 18 percent added to his or her base pay.

Bilingual Pay

Six of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments provide bilingual pay. The average bilingual pay for these six departments is \$1,500. The State has authorized \$600 per year in compensation for qualified Salary Schedule C employees with bilingual speaking proficiencies.

Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments Provide Other Types of Pay

The majority of the local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis provide two additional types of pay: field officer training pay and shift pay. The State does not provide these types of pay.

Field officer training (FTO) pay is provided to law enforcement officers who provide guidance to new law enforcement officers in areas related to (1) policies and procedures and (2) additional training upon completion of an officer's basic training program. The average FTO pay at the six local Texas law enforcement departments reviewed that provide this pay is \$1,869 per year.

Shift pay is compensation paid to employees who work shifts that are different from a normal schedule. Six of the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in this analysis provide shift pay. The average shift pay for these departments is \$3,481 per year.

Appendices

Appendix 1

Objective, Scope, and Methodology

Objective

The objective of this review was to conduct a review of the market competitiveness of the law enforcement salary schedule (Salary Schedule C).

Scope

The scope of this study included a review of the State's law enforcement total direct compensation in relation to market pay. The State Auditor's Office conducted this review in accordance with the Position Classification Act, Texas Government Code, Section 654.036 (see Appendix 2 for additional details), which requires it to:

- Make periodic studies of salary rates in other governmental units and in industry for similar work performed in state government and report those findings.
- Maintain the State's Position Classification Plan (Plan) and keep it current.
- Make necessary and desirable recommendations to improve the Plan.

In addition, Section 654.037(b) (see Appendix 2 for additional details) of the Texas Government Code requires the State Auditor's Office to:

- Conduct, before September 1 of each even-numbered year, a survey of local law enforcement departments that employ more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers to gather information about the total compensation provided by the departments to law enforcement officers.
- Analyze, before January 1 of each odd-numbered year, the findings of the most recent survey conducted in accordance with this subsection and submit to the Legislature a report on the findings of the survey and analysis.
- Identify the five local law enforcement departments that provide the highest average total compensation to local law enforcement officers who have been employed by the local law enforcement departments at the maximum salary level (see Appendix 6).

Methodology

Salary Survey Review

The State Auditor's Office conducts periodic studies of salary rates and trends in private industry and other governmental agencies for work similar to that performed in state government. In addition, the State Auditor's Office is responsible for reviewing the Plan and providing recommendations to ensure that the Plan effectively meets the needs of its users. In conducting this review, the State Auditor's Office analyzed the following:

- Salary Schedule C as approved during the 81st legislative session.
- Maximum salaries and job descriptions for similar law enforcement positions at local law enforcement departments with 1,000 or more commissioned law enforcement officers. These positions were compared with positions in the relevant labor market for the state of Texas by using the State Auditor's Office law enforcement salary survey (April 2010).
- Sources used to compile data on full-time classified state employees and their salaries included:
 - Salary for each job classification/classification series as of the second quarter of fiscal year 2010.
 - The number of incumbents in each job classification/classification series as of the second quarter of fiscal year 2010.
 - Turnover data for each Salary Schedule C job classification/classification series for fiscal year 2009.
 - Other research was gathered through review of the Texas Government Code.
- The cost of aligning Salary Schedule C with market salaries was estimated as follows:
 - The State Auditor's Office used the number of full-time classified employees in each of the classifications as of the end of the second quarter of fiscal year 2010. This information was extracted from the Comptroller of Public Accounts' Human Resources Information System, Uniform Statewide Payroll/Personnel System, and the Standardized Payroll/Personnel Reporting System.
 - The State Auditor's Office calculated the minimum estimated costs of aligning Salary Schedule C with market salaries by determining the effect of moving employees to the realigned pay rate at the same placement within the salary schedule.

Project Information

This study was conducted under the requirements of Texas Government Code, Section 654.036, and Texas Government Code, Section 654.037 (b) (see Appendix 2 for additional details). The salary survey review was conducted from April 2010 through June 2010.

This project was a review; therefore, the information in this report was not subjected to all the tests and confirmations that would be performed in an audit. However, the information in this report was subject to certain quality control procedures to ensure accuracy.

The following members of the State Auditor's Office's staff conducted this review in accordance with the Position Classification Act, Texas Government Code, Chapter 654:

- Stacey Robbins McClure, MBA, PHR, CCP (Project Manager)
- Steve Pearson, IPMA-HR
- Jeannette Quinonez, CPA
- Sharon Schneider, PHR
- Charles P. Dunlap, Jr., CPA (Quality Control Reviewer)
- Nicole Guerrero, MBA, CIA, CGAP, CICA (Audit Manager)

Excerpts from the Texas Government Code

Section 654.036. GENERAL DUTIES OF CLASSIFICATION OFFICER.

The classification officer shall:

(1) maintain and keep current the position classification plan; (2) advise and assist state agencies in equitably and uniformly applying the plan; (3) conduct classification compliance audits to ensure conformity with the plan; and (4) make recommendations that the classification officer finds necessary and desirable about the operation and for improvement of the plan to the governor and the legislature.

Section 654.037. SALARY STUDIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

(a) The classification officer shall: (1) make periodic studies of salary rates in other governmental units and in industry for similar work performed in state government; and (2) report the classification officer's findings from the studies made under Subdivision (1) to the governor's budget office and the Legislative Budget Board not later than October 1 preceding each regular session of the legislature.

(b) The classification officer shall conduct, before September 1 of each even-numbered year, a survey of local law enforcement departments that employ more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers to gather information about the total compensation provided by the departments to law enforcement officers. Before January 1 of each odd-numbered year, the classification officer shall analyze the findings of the most recent survey conducted in accordance with this subsection and shall submit to the legislature a report on the findings of the survey and analysis. The report must identify the five local law enforcement departments that provide the highest average total compensation to local law enforcement officers who have been employed by the local law enforcement departments at the maximum salary level.

(c) To improve the ability of the state to recruit and retain qualified law enforcement officers, the legislature may consider the report submitted under Subsection (b) in determining the salaries of all state law enforcement officers who hold a position classified under the state employee classification system and are compensated under Salary Schedule C of the General Appropriations Act.

Retirement Benefits Provided by the Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments Reviewed

Table 23 presents a summary of the retirement benefits provided by the seven local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers.

Table 23

Retirement Benefits Provided by Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments with More than 1,000 Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers							
Local Texas Law Enforcement Department	Retirement System	Employee Contribution Rate	Local Texas Law Enforcement Contribution Rate	Benefit Multiplier	Retirement Eligibility	Social Security (Yes/No)	Type of Plan
City of Austin	Austin Police Retirement System	13.00%	18.25%	3.20%	Age 55 and 20-years of creditable service (excluding pre-membership military service)	Yes	Defined Benefit
City of Dallas	Dallas Police and Fire Pension System	8.50%	27.50%	3.00%	5 at 50 – If employee has at least five years of pension service, employee is entitled to receive an unreduced pension at age 50 or later	No	Defined Benefit
City of El Paso	El Paso Firemen and Policemen’s Pension Fund	13.89%	18.50%	2.75%	At least age 45, with 20 years of service	No	Defined Benefit
City of Fort Worth	City of Fort Worth Employees’ Retirement Fund	8.39%	15.96%	3.00%	Police officers may retire after completing 25 years of service regardless of age	No	Defined Benefit
City of Houston	Houston Police Officers’ Pension System	9.11%	19.60%	2.75%	If hired before October 9, 2004, employee must have 20 years of creditable service. If hired after October 9, 2004, employee must be age 55 with 10 years of creditable service.	No	Defined Benefit

**Retirement Benefits Provided by
Seven Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments with More than 1,000 Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers**

Local Texas Law Enforcement Department	Retirement System	Employee Contribution Rate	Local Texas Law Enforcement Contribution Rate	Benefit Multiplier	Retirement Eligibility	Social Security (Yes/No)	Type of Plan
City of San Antonio	San Antonio Fire and Police Pension Fund	12.32%	24.64%	[2.25% x (High 36 Mos. Salary) x YCS 1-20] + [4.5% x (High 36 Mos. Salary) x YCS 21-27] + [3% x (High 36 Mos. Salary) x YCS 28-30] + [0.5% x (High 36 Mos. Salary) x YCS 31-34] (“YCS” stands for years of creditable service)	20 years of creditable service	No	Defined Benefit
Harris County	Texas County and District Retirement System	7.00%	9.74%	[(Accumulated member contributions + Earned interest on member account) + Subdivision-financed monetary credits]/annuity purchase price	Combined age and credited service of 75 or more; 8 years of credited service at age 60; or 30 years of credited service at any age	Yes	Non-traditional Defined Benefit Plan
State of Texas	Employees Retirement System	7.00%	6.95%	2.80%	20 years of service at or over age 50	Yes	Defined Benefit

Sources: *2009 Guide to Public Retirement Systems in Texas*, Texas Pension Review Board; and Law Enforcement Salary Surveys submitted by cities and counties.

Law Enforcement Pay at Selected Higher Education Institutions

Tables 24 through 28 provide a summary of law enforcement salary schedules at higher education institutions located within the same geographic area as the seven local Texas law enforcement departments in the State Auditor's Office analysis. This information was not considered in this analysis and was gathered for informational purposes only. Higher education institutions establish minimum pay for police positions. However, they may hire individuals at higher pay rates than the established minimum of the pay ranges if the employee has a higher level of qualifications.

Table 24

Pay for Police Cadets at Higher Education Institutions		
Higher Education Institution	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
The University of Texas at Austin	\$36,096	\$38,736
The University of Texas at Dallas	\$28,620	\$44,064
The University of Texas at El Paso	\$28,272	\$35,352
The University of North Texas Health Science Center at Fort Worth	\$28,404	\$41,208
The University of Houston	\$26,894	\$40,331
The University of Texas at San Antonio	\$26,328	\$42,120
Average	\$29,102	\$40,302
State of Texas	\$35,787	\$35,787

Table 25

Pay for Police Officers at Higher Education Institutions		
Higher Education Institution	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
The University of Texas at Austin	\$40,008	\$65,004
The University of Texas at Dallas	\$33,696	\$58,476
The University of Texas at El Paso	\$31,104	\$65,760
The University of North Texas Health Science Center at Fort Worth	\$28,404	\$46,524
The University of Houston	\$34,861	\$62,109
The University of Texas at San Antonio	\$31,848	\$69,252
Average	\$33,320	\$61,187
State of Texas	\$47,221	\$61,793

Table 26

Pay for Sergeants at Higher Education Institutions		
Higher Education Institution	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
The University of Texas at Austin	\$51,300	\$74,712
The University of Texas at Dallas	\$43,056	\$70,608
The University of Texas at El Paso	\$46,452	\$64,896
The University of North Texas Health Science Center at Fort Worth	\$36,240	\$52,596
The University of Houston	\$45,219	\$72,322
The University of Texas at San Antonio	\$47,016	\$77,568
Average	\$44,881	\$68,784
State of Texas	\$57,578	\$69,043

Table 27

Pay for Lieutenants at Higher Education Institutions		
Higher Education Institution	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
The University of Texas at Austin	\$60,648	\$87,816
The University of Texas at Dallas	\$46,728	\$77,580
The University of Texas at El Paso	\$60,000	\$90,000
The University of North Texas Health Science Center - Fort Worth	\$40,932	\$59,364
The University of Houston	\$59,821	\$95,639
The University of Texas at San Antonio	\$51,684	\$87,852
Average	\$53,302	\$83,042
State of Texas	\$64,489	\$76,714

Table 28

Pay for Captains at Higher Education Institutions		
Higher Education Institution	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
The University of Texas at Austin	\$70,884	\$105,000
The University of Texas at Dallas	\$50,712	\$ 85,224
The University of Texas at El Paso	\$74,664	\$112,008
The University of North Texas Health Science Center - Fort Worth	\$46,368	\$ 67,248
The University of Houston	\$67,475	\$111,675
The University of Texas at San Antonio	\$57,888	\$ 98,400
Average	\$61,332	\$ 96,593
State of Texas	\$71,470	\$ 84,427

Summary of Supplemental Pay Provided by Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments with More than 1,000 Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers

Table 29 provides details on the maximum supplemental pay provided by local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 commissioned law enforcement officers.

Table 29

Supplemental Pay Provided by Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments With More than 1,000 Commissioned Law Enforcement Officers						
Law Enforcement Department	Education Pay (Bachelor's Degree)	Certification Pay (Master's Certification)	Longevity Pay	Language Pay	Field Training Officer (FTO) Duty Pay	Shift Differential Pay ^b
State of Texas	\$1,800	\$1,800	\$ 3,600	\$ 600	None	None
City of Austin ^a	\$2,640	\$1,800	\$ 2,400	\$2,100	\$1,800	\$3,600
City of Dallas	\$1,200	\$6,000	\$ 1,200	\$1,800	\$1,200	\$4,864
City of El Paso	\$1,500	\$1,260	\$ 1,200	None	\$2,431	\$2,431
City of Fort Worth ^a	\$1,440	\$1,440	\$ 1,200	\$1,200	None	\$3,993
City of Houston	\$3,640	\$8,282	\$ 1,300	\$1,800	\$1,800	\$1,800
City of San Antonio	\$3,780	\$2,880	\$12,029	\$ 600	\$1,884	\$4,200
Harris County	\$3,180	\$6,000	\$ 1,800	\$1,500	\$2,100	None

^a The City of Austin, City of Fort Worth, and Harris County provide education pay or certification pay, but not both.

^b Shift differential pay can be paid in a flat amount or per hour. If paid per hour, amount in this table is based on average pay reported for the Police Officer position.

Source: State Auditor's Office law enforcement survey, April 2010.

Five Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments That Provide the Highest Average Total Direct Compensation

Texas Government Code, Section 654.037(b), requires the State Auditor's Office to conduct a survey of the local Texas law enforcement departments in Texas with 1,000 or more commissioned law enforcement officers. The following information lists the five local Texas law enforcement departments that provide the highest average total compensation to law enforcement officers who have been employed at the maximum salary level. Table 30 provides a summary of direct compensation provided by these five local Texas law enforcement departments for a Police Officer. A Police Officer position is comparable to a salary group C3 position (for example, Trooper) contained in Salary Schedule C.

Table 30

The Five Local Texas Law Enforcement Departments That Provide the Highest Average Total Direct Compensation			
Local Texas Law Enforcement Department	Maximum Pay	Value of Supplemental Pay	Total Direct Compensation
City of Austin	\$89,983	\$12,540	\$102,523
City of Fort Worth	\$79,851	\$ 7,833	\$ 87,684
City of Dallas	\$74,837	\$16,264	\$ 91,101
City of San Antonio	\$66,828	\$25,373	\$ 92,201
Harris County	\$70,366	\$11,400	\$ 81,766
State of Texas ^a	\$61,793	\$ 6,000	\$67,793
^a State of Texas information was calculated based on 30 years of service and education pay or certification pay (but not both).			

Law Enforcement Salary Survey Results

Tables 31 through 37 provide a summary of the minimum and maximum salaries for the ranks within each of the local Texas law enforcement departments with more than 1,000 local law enforcement officers. These tables also include the number of employees currently budgeted or employed in the rank and the average pay for the employees within that rank as provided by the local Texas law enforcement departments. This information was compiled from data reported by law enforcement agencies in response to a survey conducted by the State Auditor's Office in April 2010.

Table 31

City of Austin			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Cadet	78	\$ 32,001	\$ 32,001
Police Officer	931	\$ 50,848	\$ 82,553
Corporal	351	\$ 68,646	\$ 89,983
Sergeant	172	\$ 80,061	\$ 98,078
Lieutenant	67	\$ 92,071	\$ 112,792
Commander	19	\$113,917	\$ 130,422
Assistant Chief	5	None	\$ 148,920 ^a
Chief	1	None	\$ 181,480 ^a
Total	1,624		

^a The information provided in the maximum pay column is the average annual pay for these positions as provided by the City of Austin in its survey response.

Table 32

City of Dallas			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Trainee (I, II, and III)	544	\$41,690	\$ 41,690
Police Officer	1,147	\$41,690	\$ 67,884
Corporal	21	\$48,249	\$ 67,884
Senior Corporal	1,393	\$42,860	\$ 74,837
Sergeant	431	\$49,235	\$ 81,966
Lieutenant	100	\$54,028	\$ 89,778
Captain	2	\$59,279	\$ 98,526
Deputy Chief	16	\$64,821	\$103,835
Assistant Chief	6	\$65,698	\$ 98,005
Chief	1	\$86,459	\$195,057
Total	3,661		

Table 33

City of El Paso			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Officer Trainee	Currently has no employees in this rank	\$ 33,862	\$ 33,862
Probationary Officer	4	\$ 36,165	\$ 41,866
Police Officer	304	\$ 43,959	\$ 50,888
Detective	160	\$ 43,959	\$ 50,888
Senior Police Officer	452	\$ 52,415	\$ 60,763
Sergeant	124	\$ 56,084	\$ 67,656
Lieutenant	38	\$ 65,675	\$ 80,021
Commander	9	\$ 75,351	\$ 94,409
Assistant Police Chief	5	\$114,755	\$126,518
Police Chief	1	\$ 97,544	\$165,824
Total	1,097		

Table 34

City of Fort Worth			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Officer Trainee	Currently has no employees at this rank	\$ 37,377	\$ 37,377
Police Officer	1,100	\$ 48,838	\$ 72,321
Police Corporal	207	\$ 62,400	\$ 79,851
Police Sergeant	160	\$ 72,207	\$ 87,984
Police Lieutenant	46	\$ 83,616	\$ 96,990
Police Captain	12	\$ 94,515	\$106,912
Police Deputy Chief	5	\$ 88,608	\$132,080
Police Chief	1	\$111,030	\$183,206
Total	1,531		

Table 35

City of Houston			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Cadet	Currently has no employees at this rank		
Probationary Police Officer	142	\$ 28,169	\$ 28,169
Police Officer	2,032	\$ 38,602	\$ 53,622
Senior Police Officer	1,941	\$ 54,774	\$ 59,192
Sergeant	944	\$ 66,209	\$ 72,186
Lieutenant	195	\$ 74,321	\$ 81,021
Captain	42	\$ 85,109	\$ 92,816
Assistant Chief	10	\$119,431	\$125,434
Executive Assistant Police Chief	4	\$137,978	\$144,963
Police Chief	1	\$ 99,112	\$221,338
Total	5,311		

Table 36

City of San Antonio			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Police Cadet	54	\$ 28,428	\$ 28,428
Probationary Police Officer	75	\$ 38,340	\$ 38,340
Police Officer	1,510	\$ 44,136	\$ 60,120
Detective/Investigator	348	\$ 61,800	\$ 66,828
Sergeant	218	\$ 70,200	\$ 73,020
Lieutenant	45	\$ 78,612	\$ 81,792
Captain	18	\$ 90,216	\$ 93,852
Deputy Police Chief	4	\$124,872	\$124,872
Assistant Police Chief	2	\$134,856	\$134,856
Chief	1	\$ 92,700	\$185,400
Total	2,275		

Table 37

Harris County			
Rank	Number of Employees in Rank	Minimum Pay	Maximum Pay
Deputy (Level I -VI)	1,246	\$40,643	\$ 55,889
Senior Deputy	627	\$59,800	\$ 59,800
Accident and Crime Investigator	52	\$60,091	\$ 70,366
Sergeant	349	\$63,398	\$ 70,553
Lieutenant	52	\$72,675	\$ 78,603
Captain	21	\$82,534	\$ 90,937
Major	11	None	\$ 122,803
Chief	0	None	\$ 135,096
Sheriff	1	None	\$174,216 ^a
Total	2,359		
^a Actual average salary was provided by department in its responses during analysis performed for <i>A Classification Study of Exempt Positions</i> (State Auditor's Office Report 10-076, July 2010).			

Copies of this report have been distributed to the following:

Legislative Audit Committee

The Honorable David Dewhurst, Lieutenant Governor, Joint Chair
The Honorable Joe Straus III, Speaker of the House, Joint Chair
The Honorable Steve Ogden, Senate Finance Committee
The Honorable Thomas “Tommy” Williams, Member, Texas Senate
The Honorable Jim Pitts, House Appropriations Committee
The Honorable Rene Oliveira, House Ways and Means Committee

Office of the Governor

The Honorable Rick Perry, Governor

Department of Public Safety

Members of the Public Safety Commission
Mr. Allan B. Polunsky, Chair
Ms. Carin Marcy Barth
Ms. Ada Brown
Mr. C. Tom Clowe, Jr.
Mr. John Steen
Mr. Steve McCraw, Director

Parks and Wildlife Department

Members of the Parks and Wildlife Commission
Mr. Peter M. Holt, Chairman
Mr. T. Dan Friedkin, Vice-Chairman
Mr. Lee Marshall Bass
Mr. Mark E. Bivins
Mr. Ralph H. Duggins
Dr. Antonio Falcon
Ms. Karen J. Hixon
Mr. Dan Allen Hughes, Jr.
Ms. Margaret Martin
Mr. S. Reed Morian
Mr. Carter P. Smith, Executive Director

Alcoholic Beverage Commission

Members of the Alcoholic Beverage Commission
Mr. José Cuevas, Jr., Presiding Officer
Ms. Melinda S. Fredricks
Dr. Steven M. Weinberg
Mr. Alan Steen, Administrator

Department of Criminal Justice

Members of the Board of Criminal Justice

Mr. Oliver J. Bell, Chairman

Mr. Tom Mechler, Vice-Chairman

Mr. Leopoldo "Leo" Vasquez III, Secretary

Mr. John "Eric" Gambrell

Pastor Charles Lewis Jackson

Ms. Janice Harris Lord

Mr. R. Terrell McCombs

Mr. J. David Nelson

Ms. Carmen Villanueva-Hiles

Mr. Brad Livingston, Executive Director

Legislative Budget Board

Mr. John O'Brien, Director



This document is not copyrighted. Readers may make additional copies of this report as needed. In addition, most State Auditor's Office reports may be downloaded from our Web site: www.sao.state.tx.us.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, this document may also be requested in alternative formats. To do so, contact our report request line at (512) 936-9880 (Voice), (512) 936-9400 (FAX), 1-800-RELAY-TX (TDD), or visit the Robert E. Johnson Building, 1501 North Congress Avenue, Suite 4.224, Austin, Texas 78701.

The State Auditor's Office is an equal opportunity employer and does not discriminate on the basis of race, color, religion, sex, national origin, age, or disability in employment or in the provision of services, programs, or activities.

To report waste, fraud, or abuse in state government call the SAO Hotline: 1-800-TX-AUDIT.